# BRAVE NEW BOCKSTEIN OPERATIONS 

ANDREW BAKER \& ALAIN JEANNERET

## Introduction

The picture of the stable homotopy category dramatically changed after the publication of [2] and improvements in [5]. These new technics lead to an easy and conceptual definition of the Bockstein operations associated to a quotient $A$ of a commutative $S$-algebra $R$, see [5].

The aim of this paper is to discussed the algebra (and coalgebra) of operations associated to $R$-modules and their relationship with the stable operations. Most of the results of this paper are known to experts but the proofs are spread in various papers. Here we present elementary proofs and give various examples.

## 1. Background

In this paper we freely use the notation and terminology of [2,5]. Let $R$ be a commutative $S$-algebra, with $R_{*}$ concentrated in even dimension, $\mathscr{M}_{R}$ be the category of $R$-modules and $\mathscr{D}_{R}$ its derived category.

A $R$-ring is a ring $A$ in the category $\mathscr{D}_{R}$ and

$$
\varphi_{A}: A \wedge_{R} A \longrightarrow A
$$

denotes the product.
The functor $A_{R}^{*}(-)=\mathscr{D}_{R}(-, A)$ defines a cohomology theory while $A_{*}^{R}(-)=\pi_{*}\left(A \wedge_{R^{-}}\right)$ defines a homology theory on either of the categories $\mathscr{M}_{R}$ or $\mathscr{D}_{R}$. Let $f: A \longrightarrow B$ be a map in $\mathscr{M}_{R}$. Then $f$ induces homology and cohomology operations

$$
f: A_{*}^{R}(-) \longrightarrow B_{*}^{R}(-), \quad f: A_{R}^{*}(-) \longrightarrow B_{R}^{*}(-)
$$

Also for any homology theory $E_{*}^{R}(-)$ or cohomology theory $E_{R}^{*}(-)$ there are $E_{*}$-module homomorphisms

$$
f_{*}: E_{*}^{R}(A) \longrightarrow E_{*}^{R}(B), \quad f^{*}: E_{R}^{*}(B) \longrightarrow E_{R}^{*}(A) .
$$

When $A=B=E$ it may very well happen that the operations $f$ do not coincide with the morphisms $f_{*}$ or $f^{*}$.

Recall some further definitions. Let $X$ and $Y$ be $R$-modules and $a \in A_{*}^{R}(X), b \in A_{*}^{R}(Y)$. Then

$$
a \otimes b=(\varphi \wedge 1 \wedge 1) \circ(1 \wedge \tau \wedge 1) \circ(a \wedge b) \in A_{*}^{R}\left(X \wedge_{R} Y\right)
$$

where $\tau$ denotes the switch map, and if $x \in A_{R}^{*}(X), y \in A_{R}^{*}(Y)$, then

$$
x \otimes y=\varphi \circ(x \wedge y) \in A_{R}^{*}\left(X \wedge_{R} Y\right) .
$$

The Kronecker pairing

$$
A_{R}^{*}(X) \longrightarrow \operatorname{Hom}_{A_{*}}\left(A_{*}^{R}(X), A_{*}\right)
$$

is defined by

$$
\langle x, a\rangle=\varphi \circ(1 \wedge x) \circ a .
$$

If $A$ is commutative (up to homotopy) then

$$
\langle x \otimes y, a \otimes b\rangle=\langle x, a\rangle\langle y, b\rangle,
$$

2000 Mathematics Subject Classification. 55N20 55P42 55P43 55S05.
Key words and phrases. $S$-algebra, ring spectrum, cohomology operation, Bockstein operation.
The second author would like to thank the Edinburgh Mathematical Society for its financial support and the University of Glasgow for its hospitality during the preparation of this work.
Glasgow University Mathematics Department preprint no. 03/18
[Version 1: 25/06/2003] .
if $A$ is non commutative then the situation is much more delicate, see Lemma 3.4.
We now consider quotients of the commutative $S$-algebra $R$. Let $x \in R_{d}$ be an element which is not a zero divisor (recall that $d$ is even). By construction $R / x$ fits into the cofibre sequence

$$
\Sigma^{d} R \xrightarrow{x} R \xrightarrow{\rho_{x}} R / x \xrightarrow{\beta_{x}} \Sigma^{d+1} R .
$$

Let $\varphi: R / x \wedge_{R} R / x \longrightarrow R / x$ be a product, then any other product $\varphi^{\prime}$ on $R / x$ is given by

$$
\varphi^{\prime}=\varphi+u \circ(\beta \wedge \beta)
$$

for some $u \in \pi_{2 d+2} R / x$, in particular for the opposite product

$$
\varphi^{\mathrm{op}}=\varphi \circ \tau=\varphi+u \circ(\beta \wedge \beta)
$$

The symbol $A^{\mathrm{op}}$ will denote the ring $A$ endowed with the opposite product $\varphi^{\mathrm{op}}$.
Let $S=\left\{x_{1}, x_{2}, \ldots\right\}$ be a regular sequence in $R_{*}$ generating an ideal $I \triangleleft R_{*}$. We define the $R$-module $A=R / I$ or $A=R / S$ to be the smash product taken over $R$ :

$$
\begin{equation*}
A=\bigwedge_{R}^{x_{i} \in S} R / x_{i} \tag{1.1}
\end{equation*}
$$

If we splice together all the products $\varphi_{i}$ (on the various $R / x_{i}$ ) we obtain a product $\varphi_{A}$ on $A$. The product $\varphi_{A}$ as well as the $\varphi_{i}$ are unital and associative up to homotopy; for details see $[2,5]$.

## 2. Brave new Bockstein operations

Let $A$ be defined as in (1.1). We first fix some notation. By construction $R / x_{i}$ fits into the cofibre sequence

$$
\begin{equation*}
\Sigma^{d_{i}} R \xrightarrow{x_{i}} R \xrightarrow{\rho_{i}} R / x_{i} \xrightarrow{\beta_{i}} \Sigma^{d_{i}+1} R \tag{2.1}
\end{equation*}
$$

with $d_{i}=\operatorname{deg}\left(x_{i}\right)$. The composition

$$
q_{i}=\rho_{i} \circ \beta_{i}: R / x_{i} \longrightarrow \Sigma^{d_{i}+1} R / x_{i}
$$

is an $R$-module morphism known as a Bockstein operation. We then define $Q_{i}: A \longrightarrow A$ as $q_{i}$ on the $i$-th smash factor and the identity on the others. With respect to the product $\varphi_{i}$ on $R / x_{i}$ and $\varphi_{A}$ on $A$, the operations $q_{i}$ and $Q_{i}$ are derivations by [5], that is

$$
\begin{align*}
q_{i} \circ \varphi_{i} & =\varphi_{i} \circ\left(\mathrm{id} \wedge q_{i} \vee q_{i} \wedge \mathrm{id}\right)  \tag{2.2}\\
Q_{i} \circ \varphi_{A} & =\varphi_{A} \circ\left(\mathrm{id} \wedge Q_{i} \vee Q_{i} \wedge \mathrm{id}\right) \tag{2.3}
\end{align*}
$$

We will consider the map $Q_{i} \in A_{R}^{*}(A)$ more closely. A test spectrum for $Q_{i}$ is $R / x_{i}$. From the cofibration (2.1) we easily deduce that

$$
0 \rightarrow A_{R}^{*}(R) \xrightarrow{\beta_{i}^{*}} A_{R}^{*}\left(R / x_{i}\right) \xrightarrow{\rho_{i}^{*}} A_{R}^{*}(R) \rightarrow 0
$$

and

$$
0 \rightarrow A_{*}^{R}(R) \xrightarrow{\left(\rho_{i}\right)_{*}} A_{*}^{R}\left(R / x_{i}\right) \xrightarrow{\left(\beta_{i}\right)_{*}} A_{*}^{R}(R) \rightarrow 0
$$

are split short exact sequences of $A_{*}^{R}(R)=A_{*}$-modules. Writing 1 for the unit in $A_{*}$ (represented by the natural projection $R \longrightarrow A$ ) and recalling that $R_{\text {odd }}=0$, we find that there is a unique element $g_{i} \in A_{R}^{0}\left(R / x_{i}\right)$ for which $\rho_{i}^{*}\left(g_{i}\right)=1$. Defining

$$
e_{i}=\beta_{i}^{*}(1) \in A_{R}^{-d_{i}-1}\left(R / x_{i}\right)
$$

observe that $e_{i}$ is just the composite

$$
\begin{equation*}
R / x_{i} \xrightarrow{q_{i}} \Sigma^{d_{i}+1} R / x_{i} \xrightarrow{g_{i}} \Sigma^{d_{i}+1} A . \tag{2.4}
\end{equation*}
$$

As a consequence

$$
A_{R}^{*}\left(R / x_{i}\right) \cong A_{*} g_{i} \oplus A_{*} e_{i}
$$

We write $\gamma_{i}$ for $\left(\rho_{i}\right)_{*}(1)$. Let $\varepsilon_{i}$ be the unique class in $A_{*}^{R}\left(R / x_{i}\right)$ for which $\left(\beta_{i}\right)_{*}\left(\varepsilon_{i}\right)=1$ (uniqueness follows from the fact that $R_{\text {odd }}=0$ ), moreover $\operatorname{deg}\left(\varepsilon_{i}\right)=d_{i}+1$. Therefore

$$
A_{*}^{R}\left(R / x_{i}\right) \cong A_{*} \gamma_{i} \oplus A_{*} \varepsilon_{i}
$$

The Kronecker pairing

$$
\langle-,-\rangle: A_{R}^{*}\left(R / x_{i}\right) \longrightarrow \operatorname{Hom}_{A_{*}}\left(A_{*}^{R}\left(R / x_{i}\right), A_{*}\right)
$$

is easily seen to be an isomorphism. The basis $\left\{g_{i}, e_{i}\right\}$ is dual to $\left\{\gamma_{i}, \varepsilon_{i}\right\}$. This follows from the naturality of the pairing. For instance,

$$
\left\langle e_{i}, \varepsilon_{i}\right\rangle=\left\langle\beta_{i}^{*}(1), \varepsilon_{i}\right\rangle=\left\langle 1,\left(\beta_{i}\right)_{*}\left(\varepsilon_{i}\right)\right\rangle=\langle 1,1\rangle=1
$$

The same shows that $\left\langle g_{i}, \gamma_{i}\right\rangle=1$. The equality $\left\langle e_{i}, \gamma_{i}\right\rangle=0$ holds for dimensional reasons.
We now determine the action of the Bockstein maps $Q_{i}: A \longrightarrow \Sigma^{d_{i}+1} A$ on the test spectra $R / x_{i}$ and $A$. First we consider the case where we kill off a single element $x \in R_{d}$, that is $A=R / x$. In this situation

$$
A_{R}^{*}(A) \cong A_{*} g \oplus A_{*} e
$$

with $g=\mathrm{id}: A \longrightarrow A$ and $e=q: A \longrightarrow \Sigma^{d+1} A$. Here we find that $q^{*}(g)=e=q(g)$ and that $q^{*}(e)=0=q(e)$, that is

$$
q^{*}=q: A_{R}^{*}(A) \longrightarrow A_{R}^{*}(A) .
$$

In the general case $A=R / I$ with $I=\left(x_{1}, x_{2}, \ldots\right)$ we observe that the map $R / x_{i} \longrightarrow A$ induces the vertical quotient maps in the following commutative diagram.


The map $Q_{i}$ is induced by $q_{i}$ therefore, since $q_{i}=q_{i}^{*}$ in $R / x_{i}$-homology, we obtain

$$
Q_{i}=q_{i}^{*}: A_{R}^{*}\left(R / x_{i}\right) \longrightarrow A_{R}^{*}\left(R / x_{i}\right) .
$$

Moreover $Q_{i}\left(g_{i}\right)=e_{i}$ and $Q_{i}\left(e_{i}\right)=0$. Thus the operation $Q_{i}$ is non-trivial in the homotopy category $\mathscr{D}_{R}$.

Dually in homology, we find that

$$
Q_{i}=\left(q_{i}\right)_{*}: A_{*}^{R}\left(R / x_{i}\right) \longrightarrow A_{*}^{R}\left(R / x_{i}\right),
$$

$Q_{i}\left(\varepsilon_{i}\right)=\gamma_{i}$ and $Q_{i}\left(\gamma_{i}\right)=0$.

## 3. The operations and cooperations

In this section we describe $A_{*}^{R}(A)$ and $A_{R}^{*}(A)$ together with the various structures they carry. By the definition of $A$ in (1.1) together with induction and passage to the limit, there is an isomorphism of $A_{*}$-modules,

$$
\begin{equation*}
A_{*}^{R}(A) \cong \bigotimes A_{*}^{R}\left(R / x_{i}\right) \cong \Lambda_{A_{*}}\left(\alpha_{i}: x_{i} \in S\right) \tag{3.1}
\end{equation*}
$$

where $\alpha_{i}$ is the image of $\varepsilon_{i}$ under the map $g_{i}: R / x_{i} \longrightarrow A$ which satisfies

$$
\operatorname{deg}\left(\alpha_{i}\right)=\operatorname{deg}\left(\varepsilon_{i}\right)=d_{i}+1
$$

Here $\Lambda_{A_{*}}(-)$ denotes an exterior algebra over $A_{*}$.
Dually we also have isomorphisms of $A_{*}$-modules:

$$
\begin{equation*}
A_{R}^{*}(A) \cong \widehat{\bigotimes} A_{R}^{*}\left(R / x_{i}\right) \cong \widehat{\Lambda}_{A_{*}}\left(Q_{i}: x_{i} \in S\right) \tag{3.2}
\end{equation*}
$$

Here the completed tensor product is needed when the regular sequence $S=\left\{x_{1}, x_{2}, \ldots\right\}$ is infinite. The first isomorphism is induced by the maps $g_{i}: R / x_{i} \longrightarrow A$, therefore $Q_{i}$ is mapped to $e_{i}$ under $g_{i}^{*}$. Finally, $\widehat{\Lambda}_{A_{*}}(-)$ denotes the completed exterior algebra.

The duality morphism

$$
\begin{equation*}
\langle-,-\rangle: A_{R}^{*}(A) \longrightarrow \operatorname{Hom}_{A_{*}}\left(A_{*}^{R}(A), A_{*}\right) \tag{3.3}
\end{equation*}
$$

is an isomorphism which satisfies

$$
Q_{i}\left(\alpha_{j}\right)=\left\langle Q_{i}, \alpha_{j}\right\rangle= \begin{cases}1 & \text { if } i=j \\ 0 & \text { if } i \neq j\end{cases}
$$

The same arguments as above show that

$$
\begin{align*}
A_{*}^{R}\left(A \wedge_{R} A\right) & \cong A_{*}^{R}(A) \bigotimes A_{*}^{R}(A)  \tag{3.4}\\
A_{R}^{*}\left(A \wedge_{R} A\right) & \cong A_{R}^{*}(A) \bigotimes A_{R}^{*}(A) \tag{3.5}
\end{align*}
$$

Now we consider the various structures on $A_{R}^{*}(A)$ and $A_{*}^{R}(A)$. First define $\eta$ as

$$
\eta: A=R \wedge_{R} A \xrightarrow{1 \wedge \mathrm{id}} A \wedge_{R} A
$$

where $1: R \longrightarrow A$ (the projection) is the unit of $A$. The composition of $R$-module homomorphisms induces an algebra structure on $A_{R}^{*}(A)$. Thanks to the isomorphism of (3.5) the product of $x, y \in A_{R}^{*}(A)$ can be described as the composite

$$
A \xrightarrow{\eta} A \wedge_{R} A \xrightarrow{x \wedge y} A \wedge_{R} A \xrightarrow{\varphi_{A}} A
$$

So the product is given by

$$
A_{R}^{*}(A) \bigotimes A_{R}^{*}(A) \cong A_{R}^{*}\left(A \wedge_{R} A\right) \xrightarrow{\eta^{*}} A_{R}^{*}(A)
$$

It is also possible to define a coalgebra structure on $A_{R}^{*}(A)$. The coproduct is induced by $\varphi_{A}$, that is

$$
A_{R}^{*}(A) \xrightarrow{\varphi_{A}^{*}} A_{R}^{*}\left(A \wedge_{R} A\right) \cong A_{R}^{*}(A) \bigotimes A_{R}^{*}(A)
$$

In homology the product is induced by $\varphi_{A}$, i.e.,

$$
A_{*}^{R}(A) \bigotimes A_{*}^{R}(A) \cong A_{*}^{R}\left(A \wedge_{R} A\right) \xrightarrow{\left(\varphi_{A}\right)_{*}} A_{*}^{R}(A)
$$

and the coproduct by $\eta$, i.e.,

$$
A_{*}^{R}(A) \xrightarrow{\eta_{*}} A_{*}^{R}\left(A \wedge_{R} A\right) \cong A_{*}^{R}(A) \bigotimes A_{*}^{R}(A) .
$$

We can also define the same type of structures on $A_{R}^{*}\left(A^{\mathrm{op}}\right)$ and $A_{*}^{R}\left(A^{\mathrm{op}}\right)$.
By naturality of the Kronecker pairing, $A_{R}^{*}(A)$ is dual as algebra (resp. coalgebra) to the coalgebra (resp. algebra) $A_{*}^{R}(A)$. The same holds between $A_{R}^{*}\left(A^{\mathrm{op}}\right)$ and $A_{*}^{R}\left(A^{\text {op }}\right)$. Observe however that none of $A_{*}^{R}(A), A_{*}^{R}\left(A^{\mathrm{op}}\right), A_{R}^{*}(A)$ or $A_{R}^{*}\left(A^{\mathrm{op}}\right)$ are Hopf algebras, for the following reason. It is easy to check that $\eta$ is multiplicative, since

commutes, where the bottom horizontal map is $\left(\varphi_{A} \wedge \varphi_{A}\right) \circ(1 \wedge \tau \wedge 1)$. The problem is that $\tau$ does not induced in cohomology and homology the usual switch map $T$ on tensor product $T: V \otimes W \longrightarrow W \otimes V$. In fact the following diagram commutes.


A similar result applies in homology.
If $A$ is commutative (up to homotopy), then $A_{R}^{*}(A)$ is dual to $A_{*}^{R}(A)$ as Hopf algebras.
Theorem 3.1. As algebras over $A_{*}$,

$$
A_{R}^{*}(A) \cong \widehat{\Lambda}_{A_{*}}\left(Q_{i}: x_{i} \in S\right)
$$

The $Q_{i}$ and the unit are primitives with respect to the coalgebra structure.

Proof. The algebra structure is easily established. By construction, the $Q_{i}$ anti-commute,

$$
Q_{i} Q_{j}=-Q_{j} Q_{i} .
$$

Therefore $A_{R}^{*}(A)$ is an exterior algebra. For any $i$ the product

$$
\varphi_{i}: R / x_{i} \wedge_{R} R / x_{i} \longrightarrow R / x_{i}
$$

induces a coalgebra structure on $A_{R}^{*}\left(R / x_{i}\right)$ satisfying

$$
\begin{aligned}
\varphi_{i}^{*}\left(g_{i}\right) & =g_{i} \otimes g_{i} \\
\varphi_{i}^{*}\left(e_{i}\right) & =g_{i} \otimes e_{i}+e_{i} \otimes g_{i}
\end{aligned}
$$

These equalities follow from the definition of $g_{i}$ and $e_{i}$ in (2.4) and the derivation rule (2.2). Then we paste all the $A_{R}^{*}\left(R / x_{i}\right)$ together to obtain the result.

Recall that for any $i$ there exists a well defined class $u_{i} \in \pi_{*} R / x_{i}$ such that $\varphi_{i}^{\mathrm{op}}=\varphi_{i}+u_{i} \circ$ $\left(\beta_{i} \wedge \beta_{i}\right)$.

Theorem 3.2. As algebras over $A_{*}$,

$$
A_{R}^{*}\left(A^{\mathrm{op}}\right) \cong \widehat{\Lambda}_{A_{*}}\left(Q_{i}: x_{i} \in S\right)
$$

The $Q_{i}$ are primitives with respect to the coalgebra structure while the coproduct of 1 satisfies

$$
\left(\varphi_{A}^{\mathrm{op}}\right)^{*}(1)=1 \otimes 1+\sum u_{i} \cdot Q_{i} \otimes Q_{i}
$$

Proof. The algebra structure of $A_{R}^{*}\left(A^{\mathrm{op}}\right)$ is independent of $\varphi_{A}^{\mathrm{op}}$, thus $A_{R}^{*}\left(A^{\mathrm{op}}\right) \cong A_{R}^{*}(A)$ as algebras.

The product $\varphi_{i}^{\mathrm{op}}: R / x_{i} \wedge_{R} R / x_{i} \longrightarrow R / x_{i}$ induces a coalgebra structure on $A_{R}^{*}\left(R / x_{i}^{\mathrm{op}}\right)$, we easily check that

$$
\left(\varphi_{i}^{\mathrm{op}}\right)^{*}\left(e_{i}\right)=\varphi_{i}^{*}\left(e_{i}\right)+e_{i} \circ u_{i} \circ\left(\beta_{i} \wedge \beta_{i}\right)
$$

but $e_{i} \circ u_{i}=0$, by (2.4) together with the fact that $q_{i}$ acts trivially on elements coming from $R_{*}$. Now

$$
\begin{aligned}
\left(\varphi_{i}^{\mathrm{op}}\right)^{*}\left(g_{i}\right) & =\varphi_{i}^{*}\left(g_{i}\right)+g_{i} \circ u_{i} \circ\left(\beta_{i} \wedge \beta_{i}\right) \\
& =g_{i} \otimes g_{i}+u_{i} \cdot e_{i} \otimes e_{i}
\end{aligned}
$$

The second equality follows from the definitions of $e_{i}$ and $g_{i}$. Now we can paste all the $A_{R}^{*}\left(R / x_{i}^{\mathrm{op}}\right)$ together to obtain the result.

The case of homology seems much more interesting.
Theorem 3.3. As algebras over $A_{*}$,

$$
A_{*}^{R}\left(A^{\mathrm{op}}\right)=\Lambda_{A_{*}}\left(\alpha_{i}: x_{i} \in S\right)
$$

The $\alpha_{i}$ and the unit are primitives with respect to the coalgebra structure.
We first restrict our attention to the case where $A=R / x$ and $x \in R_{d}$. We have the cofibre sequence

$$
\Sigma^{d} R \xrightarrow{x} R \xrightarrow{\rho} A \xrightarrow{\beta} \Sigma^{d+1} R .
$$

Let $\varphi: A \wedge_{R} A \longrightarrow A$ be a product and

$$
\varphi^{\mathrm{op}}=\varphi \circ \tau=\varphi+u \circ(\beta \wedge \beta)
$$

for some well defined class $u \in A_{2 d+2}$.
The following Lemma is the crucial step in the proof of Theorem 3.3.
Lemma 3.4. For $a \in A_{*}^{R}(X), b \in A_{*}^{R}(Y), x \in A_{R}^{*}(X)$ and $y \in A_{R}^{*}(Y)$, the Kronecker pairing satisfies

$$
\langle x, a\rangle\langle y, b\rangle=\langle x \otimes y, a \otimes b\rangle-u \beta_{*}\left(x_{*}(a)\right) \beta\left(y_{*}(b)\right)
$$

Proof. The reader is encouraged to draw the diagrams corresponding to the following complicated equalities.

$$
\begin{aligned}
\langle x, a\rangle\langle y, b\rangle= & \varphi \circ(\varphi \wedge \varphi) \circ(1 \wedge x \wedge 1 \wedge y) \circ(a \wedge b) \\
= & \varphi \circ(1 \wedge \varphi) \circ(1 \wedge \varphi \wedge 1) \circ(1 \wedge x \wedge 1 \wedge y) \circ(a \wedge b) \\
= & \varphi \circ(1 \wedge \varphi) \circ\left(1 \wedge \varphi^{\mathrm{op}} \wedge 1\right) \circ(1 \wedge x \wedge 1 \wedge y) \circ(a \wedge b) \\
& \quad-\varphi \circ(1 \wedge \varphi) \circ(1 \wedge(u \circ(\beta \wedge \beta)) \wedge 1) \circ(1 \wedge x \wedge 1 \wedge y) \circ(a \wedge b)
\end{aligned}
$$

The first equality follows from the definition, the second by associativity of the product and the third by definition of the opposite product.

We consider separately the two summands of the last term. The first one is

$$
\begin{aligned}
\varphi \circ(1 \wedge \varphi) \circ & \left(1 \wedge \varphi^{\circ \mathrm{p}} \wedge 1\right) \circ(1 \wedge x \wedge 1 \wedge y) \circ(a \wedge b) \\
& =\varphi \circ(1 \wedge \varphi) \circ(1 \wedge \varphi \wedge 1) \circ(1 \wedge \tau \wedge 1) \circ(1 \wedge x \wedge 1 \wedge y) \circ(a \wedge b) \\
& =\varphi \circ(1 \wedge \varphi) \circ(1 \wedge \varphi \wedge 1) \circ(1 \wedge 1 \wedge x \wedge y) \circ(1 \wedge \tau \wedge 1) \circ(a \wedge b) \\
& =\varphi \circ(1 \wedge \varphi) \circ(\varphi \wedge 1 \wedge 1) \circ(1 \wedge 1 \wedge x \wedge y) \circ(1 \wedge \tau \wedge 1) \circ(a \wedge b) \\
& =\varphi \circ(1 \wedge \varphi) \circ(1 \wedge x \wedge y) \circ(\varphi \wedge 1 \wedge 1) \circ(1 \wedge \tau \wedge 1) \circ(a \wedge b) \\
& =\varphi \circ(x \otimes y) \circ(a \otimes b) \\
& =\langle x \otimes y, a \otimes b\rangle
\end{aligned}
$$

The first equality follows from the definition of the opposite product, the second is obvious, the third uses associativity of the product, the fourth is obvious, the fifth follows from the definition of the exterior product in homology and cohomology and the last one is the definition of the Kronecker pairing.

In the second summand,

$$
\begin{aligned}
\varphi \circ(1 \wedge \varphi) \circ(1 \wedge(u \circ & (\beta \wedge \beta)) \wedge 1) \circ(1 \wedge x \wedge 1 \wedge y) \circ(a \wedge b) \\
& =\varphi \circ(1 \wedge \varphi) \circ(1 \wedge(u \circ(\beta \wedge \beta)) \wedge 1) \circ\left(x_{*}(a) \wedge y_{*}(b)\right) \\
& =\varphi \circ(1 \wedge \varphi) \circ(1 \wedge u \wedge 1) \circ\left(\beta_{*}\left(x_{*}(a)\right) \wedge \beta\left(y_{*}(b)\right)\right) \\
& =u \beta_{*}\left(x_{*}(a)\right) \beta\left(y_{*}(b)\right)
\end{aligned}
$$

The first equality follows from the definition of an induced morphism, the second from the definitions of induced morphism and induced operation while the last one is obvious. Now combining these results, the Lemma is proven.

Proof of Theorem 3.3. We first restrict our attention to the special case $A=R / x$ with notation as above. We have already shown that

$$
A_{R}^{*}(A) \cong \Lambda_{A_{*}}(q)
$$

as $A_{*}$-algebras, where $q$ stands for the composite $\rho \circ \beta$ and

$$
A_{*}^{R}\left(A^{\mathrm{op}}\right) \cong \Lambda_{A_{*}}(\alpha)
$$

as $A_{*}$-modules with $\operatorname{deg}(\alpha)=d+1$. Moreover $\{1, q\}$ is the dual basis of $\{1, \alpha\}$. Now to show that $A_{*}^{R}\left(A^{\mathrm{op}}\right)$ is an exterior algebra it is sufficient to prove that $\left\langle x, \alpha^{2}\right\rangle=0$ for any $x \in A_{R}^{*}(A)$. We only need to consider the cases $x=q$ and $x=1$. In general we have

$$
\left\langle x, \alpha^{2}\right\rangle=\left\langle x, \varphi_{*}^{\mathrm{op}}(\alpha \otimes \alpha)\right\rangle=\left\langle\left(\varphi^{\mathrm{op}}\right)^{*}(x), \alpha \otimes \alpha\right\rangle
$$

When $x=q$, since $q$ is a derivation with respect to any product on $A$ we find

$$
\begin{aligned}
\left(\varphi^{\mathrm{op}}\right)^{*}(q) & =\varphi^{*}(q)+(u \circ(\beta \wedge \beta))^{*}(q) \\
& =q \otimes 1+1 \otimes q+q \circ(u \circ(\beta \wedge \beta)) \\
& =q \otimes 1+1 \otimes q
\end{aligned}
$$

since $A_{\text {odd }}=0, q \circ u=0$. Applying Lemma 3.4 we obtain

$$
\langle q \otimes 1, \alpha \otimes \alpha\rangle=u \beta_{*}\left(q_{*}(\alpha)\right) \beta\left(q_{*}(\alpha)\right)=0
$$

since $\beta \circ q=0$. A similar calculation shows that $\langle 1 \otimes q, \alpha \otimes \alpha\rangle=0$.
Next in the case $x=1$, we have

$$
\left\langle 1, \alpha^{2}\right\rangle=\langle 1 \otimes 1, \alpha \otimes \alpha\rangle+\langle 1 \circ u \circ(\beta \wedge \beta), \alpha \otimes \alpha\rangle .
$$

We will show that the first summand is equal to $u$. The element $1 \in A_{R}^{*}(A)$ is represented by the identity, hence because of Lemma 3.4 it suffices to show that $\beta_{*}(\alpha)=1=\beta(\alpha)$. As $A_{*}=R_{*} /(x)$, the algebra $A_{*}^{R}\left(A^{\mathrm{op}}\right)$ has $A_{*}$ in its center, thus the two homomorphisms $\rho, \rho_{*}: A_{*} \longrightarrow A_{*}^{R}\left(A^{\mathrm{op}}\right)$ coincide. We have already shown that

$$
q(\alpha)=q_{*}(\alpha)=1,
$$

so since $\rho$ is injective it follows that

$$
\beta(\alpha)=\beta_{*}(\alpha)=1 .
$$

The second summand satisfies

$$
\langle 1 \circ u \circ(\beta \wedge \beta), \alpha \otimes \alpha\rangle=-u
$$

This holds since $\beta_{*}(\alpha)=1$, the sign comes from the fact that the twist map

$$
\tau: \Sigma^{d+1} A \wedge A \longrightarrow A \wedge \Sigma^{d+1} A
$$

is a map of degree -1 since $d$ is even.
Now consider the general case $A=R / I$ and $I=\left(x_{1}, x_{2}, \ldots\right)$. For any $i$,

$$
\varphi_{i}^{\mathrm{op}}=\varphi_{i} \circ \tau=\varphi_{i}+u_{i} \circ\left(\beta_{i} \wedge \beta_{i}\right)
$$

The morphisms of $R$ ring spectra $R / x_{i} \longrightarrow A$ induce ring homomorphisms

$$
\left(R / x_{i}\right)_{*}^{R}\left(R / x_{i}^{\mathrm{op}}\right) \longrightarrow A_{*}^{R}\left(R / x_{i}^{\mathrm{op}}\right)
$$

and we now easily deduce that as algebras over $A_{*}$,

$$
A_{*}^{R}\left(R / x_{i}^{\mathrm{op}}\right) \cong \Lambda_{A_{*}}\left(\alpha_{i}\right) .
$$

By construction of the product $\varphi_{A}$ on $A$, the elements $\alpha_{i}$ commute to each other, therefore

$$
A_{*}^{R}\left(A^{\mathrm{op}}\right) \cong \Lambda_{A_{*}}\left(\alpha_{i}: x_{i} \in S\right)
$$

The coalgebra structure follows easily from the naturality of the pairing

$$
\left\langle x \otimes y, \eta\left(\alpha_{i}\right)\right\rangle=\left\langle x \cdot y, \alpha_{i}\right\rangle
$$

for $x, y \in A_{R}^{*}\left(A^{\mathrm{op}}\right)$. Thus

$$
\eta\left(\alpha_{i}\right)=\alpha_{i} \otimes 1+1 \otimes \alpha_{i}
$$

and $\eta(1)=1 \otimes 1$.
A similar calculation establishes
Theorem 3.5. As algebras over $A_{*}$,

$$
A_{*}^{R}(A) \cong A_{*}\left[\alpha_{i}: x_{i} \in S\right] /\left(\alpha_{i}^{2}-u_{i}\right)
$$

where the $\alpha_{i}$ and the unit are primitives with respect to the coalgebra structure.
Remark 3.6. The $R$ ring spectra $A$ and $A^{\text {op }}$ are usually not isomorphic because the rings $A_{*}^{R}(A)$ and $A_{*}^{R}\left(A^{\mathrm{op}}\right)$ are not isomorphic. As illustrated in the examples below, in some cases $A$ and $A^{\mathrm{op}}$ may be isomorphic as $S$ ring spectra, i.e., there is a morphism of $S$ ring spectra $A \longrightarrow A^{\mathrm{op}}$ that is not a morphism of $R$ ring spectra.

## 4. Spectral sequences

In this section we consider the two spectral sequences converging to $A_{R}^{*}(A)$ and $A_{*}^{R}(A)$ respectively. Here, as usual, $A$ satisfies (1.1).

From [2], there is a multiplicative spectral sequence

$$
\mathrm{E}_{2}^{* *}=\operatorname{Ext}_{R_{*}}^{*}\left(A_{*}, A_{*}\right) \Rightarrow A_{R}^{*}(A) .
$$

We determine the $\mathrm{E}_{2}^{* *}$-term with the aid of the Koszul resolution of $A_{*}$ :

$$
\begin{equation*}
\Lambda_{R_{*}}\left(\omega_{i}: x_{i} \in S\right) \longrightarrow A_{*} \rightarrow 0, \tag{4.1}
\end{equation*}
$$

with differentials $d\left(\omega_{i}\right)=x_{i}$. The Ext module is the homology of the complex

$$
\operatorname{Hom}_{R_{*}}\left(\Lambda_{R_{*}}\left(\omega_{i}: x_{i} \in S\right)\right) \rightarrow 0 .
$$

Then we easily obtain

$$
\operatorname{Ext}_{R_{*}}^{*}\left(A_{*}, A_{*}\right) \cong \widehat{\Lambda}_{A_{*}}\left(\tau_{i}: x_{i} \in S\right)
$$

as $A_{*}$-algebras. For dimensional reasons, the differentials act trivially on the $\tau_{i}$, and so by multiplicativity the spectral sequence collapses. It is not hard to identify the Bockstein $Q_{i}$ in this spectral sequence

Theorem 4.1. The cofibre $E$ of $Q_{i}$ satisfies

$$
\pi_{*}(E) \cong R_{*} /\left(x_{1}, x_{2}, \ldots, x_{i}^{2}, \ldots\right)
$$

and the extension

$$
0 \rightarrow A_{*} \longrightarrow E_{*} \longrightarrow A_{*} \rightarrow 0
$$

represents $Q_{i}$ in $\operatorname{Ext}_{R_{*}}^{*}\left(A_{*}, A_{*}\right)$.
Proof. By construction of the $Q_{i}$ the following diagram commutes.


In homotopy it induces the diagram

which shows that $E_{*}$ is the push-out of the left-handed square, because the left vertical morphism is the natural projection, hence $E_{*}$ has the desired form.

Observe that the extension

$$
0 \rightarrow A_{*} \longrightarrow E_{*} \longrightarrow A_{*} \rightarrow 0
$$

is classified by $\tau_{i} \in \operatorname{Ext}_{R_{*}}^{1}\left(A_{*}, A_{*}\right)$, where by construction, $\tau_{i}$ is represented by the composition

$$
\bigoplus_{i} R_{*} \omega_{i} \longrightarrow R_{*} \omega_{i} \longrightarrow A_{*}
$$

of the projection on the $i$-th factor and of the quotient map.
It remains to prove that $Q_{i}$ is represented by $\tau_{i}$ in the spectral sequence. First we consider the spectral sequence for $A_{R}^{*}\left(R / x_{i}\right)$ :

$$
\mathrm{E}_{2}^{* *}=\operatorname{Ext}_{R_{*}}^{*}\left(R_{*} /\left(x_{i}\right), A_{*}\right) \Rightarrow A_{R}^{*}\left(R / x_{i}\right) .
$$

We have $\operatorname{Ext}_{R_{*}}^{*}\left(R_{*} /\left(x_{i}\right), A_{*}\right) \cong \Lambda_{A_{*}}\left(\tau_{i}\right)$ and $A_{R}^{*}\left(R / x_{i}\right) \cong \Lambda_{A_{*}}\left(e_{i}\right)$. The spectral sequence collapses for dimensional reason and $e_{i}$ is represented by $\tau_{i}$ because we do not have elements of filtration greater than one and obviously it is not of filtration zero.

For any quotient $A$ of $R$, the Koszul resolution of (4.1) can be realized geometrically

$$
\cdots \longrightarrow \bigvee_{i, j} R \omega_{i} \omega_{j} \longrightarrow \bigvee_{i} R \omega_{i} \longrightarrow A
$$

This is the main ingredient in the construction of the spectral sequence in our cases. To show that $Q_{i}$ is represented by $\tau_{i} \in \operatorname{Ext}_{R_{*}}^{1}\left(A_{*}, A_{*}\right)$, it suffices to compare the two geometrical resolutions

in which the left vertical morphism is the inclusion on the $i$-th factor. Now we easily deduce the result.

We now turn to homology and consider the Künneth spectral sequence of [2],

$$
\begin{equation*}
\mathrm{E}_{* *}^{2} \cong \operatorname{Tor}_{* *}^{R_{*}}\left(A_{*}, A_{*}\right) \Longrightarrow A_{*}^{R}(A) . \tag{4.2}
\end{equation*}
$$

As in the cohomological case, we use a Koszul resolution to compute the $\mathrm{E}^{2}$-term. We obtain

$$
\operatorname{Tor}_{*}^{R_{*}}\left(A_{*}, A_{*}\right) \cong \Lambda_{A_{*}}\left(t_{i}: x_{i} \in S\right)
$$

In this situation the spectral sequence is known to be multiplicative by [1], and we easily deduce that it collapses. Observe however that we do not need the multiplicative structure to show that it collapses. We may proceed as follows.

Observe first that it is sufficient to consider the case where we kill off only a finite number of elements in $R_{*}$ (this is legitimate because we are working in homology). In this case, the Koszul resolution (4.1) is free and of finite type, this implies that the exact couples used to construct the spectral sequences (in homology and in cohomology) are dual to each other and the modules involved are free of finite rank. The collapse of the cohomology spectral sequence then implies the collapse of the homology spectral sequence.

We can also consider the spectral sequence

$$
\begin{equation*}
\mathrm{E}_{* *}^{2} \cong \operatorname{Tor}_{* *}^{R_{*}}\left(A_{*}, A_{*}^{\mathrm{op}}\right) \Longrightarrow A_{*}^{R}\left(A^{\mathrm{op}}\right) \tag{4.3}
\end{equation*}
$$

Similar arguments show that it collapses. Because $A_{*}=A_{*}^{\text {op }}$, the spectral sequences (4.2) and (4.3) coincide. In this example we see that even though the spectral sequence is multiplicative we cannot recover $A_{*}^{R}(A)$ and $A_{*}^{R}\left(A^{\mathrm{op}}\right)$ from it.

## 5. Some examples

In this section we will be mostly interested in the morphism

$$
F^{*}: A_{R}^{*}(A)=\mathscr{D}_{R}(A, A) \longrightarrow A^{*}(A)=\mathscr{D}_{S}(A, A)
$$

induced by the forgetful functor $\mathscr{D}_{R} \longrightarrow \mathscr{D}_{S}$. The problem is to determine under which conditions the maps $Q_{i}$ are non-trivial in the category $\mathscr{D}_{S}$. We will also consider the dual map $F_{*}: A_{*}(A) \longrightarrow A_{*}^{R}(A)$ induced from the evident natural transformation between the smash product bifunctors

$$
(-) \wedge_{S}(-) \longrightarrow(-) \wedge_{R}(-)
$$

Throughout the section we will make use of the following remark.
Remark 5.1. Let $\widetilde{S} \subset S$ be regular sequences in $R_{*}$. Then

$$
R / S=R / \widetilde{S} \bigwedge_{R}^{x_{i} \in S-\widetilde{S}} \bigwedge_{R} R / x_{i} .
$$

If $\varphi: R / \widetilde{S} \longrightarrow R / \widetilde{S}$ is a morphism of $R$-modules then $\varphi \wedge \mathrm{id}: R / S \longrightarrow R / S$ is also a morphism of $R$-modules, therefore we obtain a ring map

$$
\mathscr{D}_{R}(R / \widetilde{S}, R / \widetilde{S})=R / \widetilde{S}_{R}^{*}(R / \widetilde{S}) \longrightarrow \mathscr{D}_{R}(R / S, R / S)=R / S_{R}^{*}(R / S) .
$$

If $\bar{X} \subset X$ are any sequences in $R_{*}$ then the inclusion $\bar{X} \subset X$ induces a morphism of $R$-modules $\bar{X}^{-1} R \longrightarrow X^{-1} R$. Thus we obtain the following lattice of ring maps.


We begin with the commutative $S$-algebra $R=M U$, the spectrum of the complex cobordism [2]. Let $p$ be a prime number and $M U_{(p)}$ be the $p$-localization of $M U ; M U_{(p)}$ is again a commutative $S$-algebra satisfying

$$
\pi_{*}\left(M U_{(p)}\right) \cong \mathbb{Z}_{(p)}\left[x_{1}, x_{2}, \ldots\right]
$$

with $\operatorname{deg}\left(x_{i}\right)=2 i$. We can choose the generators $x_{i}$ such that $x_{p^{i}-1}$ is the $i$-th Hazewinkel generator of $B P_{*}$, we write $v_{i}$ rather than $x_{p^{i}-1}$. Here we recall that $B P$ is a summand of $M U_{(p)}$ for which

$$
B P_{*} \cong \mathbb{Z}_{(p)}\left[v_{1}, v_{2}, \ldots\right] \subset M U_{(p) *}
$$

We consider the regular sequence $S=\left\{x_{i}: i \neq p^{k}-1, i \in \mathbb{N}\right\}$. The quotient $M U_{(p)} / S$ is a model for $B P$. Then we compute

$$
B P_{M U_{(p)}}^{*}(B P) \cong \widehat{\Lambda}_{B P_{*}}\left(K_{i}: x_{i} \in S\right)
$$

We denote the Bockstein operations by $K_{i}$ rather than $Q_{i}$. Observe that the $K_{i}$ are trivial in the stable category $\mathscr{D}_{S}$ since the ring homomorphism

$$
F^{*}: B P_{M U_{(p)}}^{*}(B P) \longrightarrow B P^{*}(B P)
$$

is trivial (in positive dimension) because $B P^{\text {odd }}(B P)=0$. Therefore we will not be interested in the generators $K_{i}$. If $B P$ were a commutative $S$-algebra (this is not known to be true at the time of writing) we could start with $R=B P$ and the situation would be cleaner.

Dually in homology and because $B P$ is commutative

$$
\begin{equation*}
B P_{*}^{M U_{(p)}}(B P) \cong \Lambda_{B P_{*}}\left(\kappa_{i}: x_{i} \in S\right) \tag{5.1}
\end{equation*}
$$

and the the morphism

$$
F_{*}: B P^{*}(B P) \longrightarrow B P_{*}^{M U_{(p)}}(B P)
$$

is trivial in positive dimension.
Let $\widetilde{S}=\left\{t_{1}, t_{2}, \ldots\right\}$ be a regular sequence in $B P_{*}$ and let $A$ be the quotient

$$
A=M U_{(p)} /\{S \cup \widetilde{S}\}=B P \bigwedge_{M U_{(p)}} M U_{(p)} / \widetilde{S}
$$

We have

$$
A_{M U_{(p)}}^{*}(A) \cong \widehat{\Lambda}_{A_{*}}\left(K_{i}: x_{i} \in S\right) \widehat{\otimes} \widehat{\Lambda}_{A_{*}}\left(Q_{i}: x_{i} \in \widetilde{S}\right)
$$

Theorem 5.2. Let $F^{*}: A_{M U_{(p)}}^{*}(A) \longrightarrow A^{*}(A)$ be the forgetful map. Then with the above notation, the $K_{i}$ are in the kernel of $F^{*}$ while the $Q_{i}$ are not.
Proof. Let $H$ denote the $\bmod p$ Eilenberg-Mac Lane spectrum

$$
H=K\left(\mathbb{F}_{p} ; 0\right)=M U_{(p)} /\left(p, x_{1}, x_{2}, \ldots\right)=B P \bigwedge_{M U_{(p)}} M U_{(p)} /\left(p, v_{1}, v_{2}, \ldots\right) .
$$

We write $B P / t_{i}$ for $B P \bigwedge_{M U_{(p)}} M U_{(p)} / t_{i}$. Since the $\bmod p$ homology Hurewicz homomorphism for $B P$ is trivial, the cofibration

$$
\Sigma^{\left|t_{i}\right|} M U_{(p)} \xrightarrow{t_{i}} M U_{(p)} \xrightarrow{\rho_{i}} M U_{(p)} \xrightarrow{\beta_{i}} \cdots
$$

induces for any $i$

$$
\begin{equation*}
H_{*}\left(B P / t_{i}\right) \cong H_{*}(B P) \otimes \Lambda_{\mathbb{F}_{p}}\left(\varepsilon_{i}\right) \tag{5.2}
\end{equation*}
$$

with $\left(\beta_{i}\right)_{*}\left(\varepsilon_{i}\right)=1$ and

$$
\begin{equation*}
H_{*}^{M U_{(p)}}\left(B P / t_{i}\right) \cong H_{*}^{M U_{(p)}}(B P) \otimes \Lambda_{\mathbb{F}_{p}}\left(\varepsilon_{i}\right) . \tag{5.3}
\end{equation*}
$$

A similar calculation to that in the previous sections shows that

$$
\begin{equation*}
H_{*}^{M U_{(p)}}(B P) \cong \Lambda_{\mathbb{F}_{p}}\left(\kappa_{i}: x_{i} \in S\right) . \tag{5.4}
\end{equation*}
$$

Here the $\kappa_{i}$ of (5.1) and (5.4) correspond under the natural map

$$
B P_{*}^{M U_{(p)}}(B P) \longrightarrow H_{*}^{M U_{(p)}}(B P) .
$$

The products $\varphi_{i}$ and $\varphi_{i}^{\mathrm{op}}$ on $B P / t_{i}$ induce the same algebra structure on either $H_{*}\left(B P / t_{i}\right)$ or $H_{*}^{B P}\left(B P / t_{i}\right)$, therefore the isomorphisms of (5.2) and (5.3) are isomorphisms of $\mathbb{F}_{p}$-algebras. By induction we obtain the isomorphisms of $\mathbb{F}_{p}$-algebras

$$
\begin{aligned}
H_{*}(A) & \cong H_{*}(B P) \otimes \Lambda_{\mathbb{F}_{p}}\left(\alpha_{i}: t_{i} \in \widetilde{S}\right), \\
H_{*}^{M U_{(p)}}(A) & \cong \Lambda_{\mathbb{F}_{p}}\left(\kappa_{i}: x_{i} \in S\right) \otimes \Lambda_{\mathbb{F}_{p}}\left(\alpha_{i}: t_{i} \in \widetilde{S}\right),
\end{aligned}
$$

where $\alpha_{i}$ is the image of $\varepsilon_{i}$ and the map

$$
F_{*}: H_{*}(A) \longrightarrow H_{*}^{M U_{(p)}}(A)
$$

is the natural projection onto $\Lambda_{\mathbb{F}_{p}}\left(\alpha_{i}: t_{i} \in \widetilde{S}\right)$.
By definition of the Bockstein $q_{i}: B P / t_{i} \longrightarrow B P / t_{i}$, we have $\left(q_{i}\right)_{*}\left(\varepsilon_{1}\right)=1$. Therefore $Q_{i}: A \longrightarrow A$ satisfies $Q_{i}\left(\alpha_{i}\right)=1$ and $Q_{i}$ is non-trivial in $\mathscr{D}_{S}$. Thus we have proved that the Bocksteins $Q_{i}$ are not in the kernel of the forgetful map $F^{*}: A_{M U_{(p)}}^{*}(A) \longrightarrow A^{*}(A)$.

When $A=H$ we have the following identification. The forgetful map

$$
F^{*}: H_{M U_{(p)}}^{*}(H) \longrightarrow H^{*}(H)
$$

is a morphism of Hopf algebras and the element $Q_{i} \in H_{M U_{(p)}}^{2 p^{i}-1}(H)$ is mapped to a non-trivial primitive element in degree $2 p^{i}-1$ in the Steenrod algebra $H^{*}(H)$, so it is the Milnor's basis element written $Q_{i}$ and the image of $F^{*}$ is the exterior algebra on such elements.

In homology we have

$$
H_{*}(H) \cong \mathbb{F}_{p}\left[\xi_{1}, \xi_{2}, \ldots\right] \otimes \Lambda_{\mathbb{F}_{p}}\left(\tau_{0}, \tau_{1}, \ldots\right)
$$

and $\tau_{i}$ is dual to Milnor basis $Q_{i}$. Therefore the map

$$
F_{*}: H_{*}(H) \longrightarrow H_{*}^{M U_{(p)}}(H) \cong \Lambda_{\mathbb{F}_{p}}\left(\alpha_{0}, \alpha_{1}, \ldots\right) \otimes \Lambda_{\mathbb{F}_{p}}\left(\kappa_{i}: x_{i} \in S\right)
$$

sends $\xi_{i}$ to 0 and $\tau_{i}$ to $\alpha_{i}$.
So far we have that the Bockstein operations $Q_{i}$ are not in the kernel of the forgetful map

$$
F^{*}: A_{M U_{(p)}}^{*}(A) \longrightarrow A^{*}(A),
$$

but we are not claiming that the latter is injective (this is false in general). For instance, consider the $p$-local Eilenberg-Mac Lane spectrum

$$
H_{(p)}=K\left(\mathbb{Z}_{(p)} ; 0\right)=M U_{(p)} /\left(x_{1}, x_{2}, \ldots\right)=B P \bigwedge_{M U_{(p)}} M U_{(p)} /\left(v_{1}, v_{2}, \ldots\right)
$$

The map $H_{(p)} \longrightarrow H$ induces the commutative diagram

and by construction the left vertical map identifies the corresponding $K_{i}$ and $Q_{i}$ for $i>0$. The bottom horizontal map is the injection into the exterior algebra generated by Milnor's elements. In degree 0 the diagram is just the $\bmod p$ reduction. In positive degrees the image of
$Q_{i} \in\left(H_{(p)}\right)_{M U_{(p)}}^{*}\left(H_{(p)}\right)$ in $\left(H_{(p)}\right)^{*}\left(H_{(p)}\right)$ is not trivial. By [4], in positive degrees $\left(H_{(p)}\right)^{*}\left(H_{(p)}\right)$ is torsion of order exactly $p$, so the image of $p Q_{i}$ is trivial and the map

$$
F^{*}:\left(H_{(p)}\right)_{M U_{(p)}}^{*}\left(H_{(p)}\right) \longrightarrow\left(H_{(p)}\right)^{*}\left(H_{(p)}\right)
$$

is not injective.
The dual situation in homology is quite interesting. In this case the map $H_{(p)} \longrightarrow H$ induces the following commutative diagram.


In degree 0 the diagram is just the $\bmod p$ reduction. In positive degrees the top horizontal map is zero since by [4], $\left(H_{(p)}\right)_{*}\left(H_{(p)}\right)$ is torsion of order $p$ and $\left(H_{(p)}\right)_{*}^{M U_{(p)}}\left(H_{(p)}\right)$ is $\mathbb{Z}_{(p)}$ free. The right vertical map identifies the $\kappa_{i}$ and $\alpha_{i}$. The map $F_{*}$ is the canonical surjection described above. Since the composite $\pi_{*} \circ F_{*}$ is trivial, the image of $\pi_{*}$ has trivial intersection with the exterior algebra generated by the $\alpha_{i}$. This is consistent with the calculations of [4].

Now we consider the case of $P(n)=B P \bigwedge_{M U_{(p)}} M U_{(p)} / I_{n}$ with $I_{n}=\left(p, v_{1}, \ldots, v_{n-1}\right)$ and let $p=2$ (when $p$ is odd $P(n)$, is homotopy commutative and the situation is much simpler to understand). Let $\varphi_{n}$ be a product on $P(n)$ compatible with the $M U_{(p)}$ structure. Then from [3], the opposite product $\varphi_{n}^{\mathrm{op}}$ satisfies

$$
\varphi_{n}^{\mathrm{op}}=\varphi_{n}+v_{n} \varphi_{n} \circ\left(Q_{n-1} \wedge Q_{n-1}\right) .
$$

Also recall from [3] that $P(n)_{*}(P(n))$ is the quotient algebra

$$
P(n)_{*}(P(n))=P(n)_{*}\left[\alpha_{0}, \ldots, \alpha_{n-1}, t_{i}: i>n\right] /\left(\alpha_{i}^{2}+t_{i+1}+v_{i+1}: i=0, \ldots, n-1\right),
$$

where $t_{i+1}$ and $v_{i}$ are to be interpreted as 0 for $i<n$. Similarly,

$$
P(n)_{*}\left(P(n)^{\mathrm{op}}\right)=P(n)_{*}\left[\alpha_{0}, \ldots, \alpha_{n-1}, t_{i}: i>n\right] /\left(\alpha_{i}^{2}+t_{i+1}: i=0, \ldots, n-1\right) .
$$

We have determined that

$$
P(n)_{*}^{M U_{(p)}}(P(n)) \cong P(n)_{*}\left[\alpha_{0}, \ldots, \alpha_{n-1}\right] /\left(\left(\alpha_{i}^{2}+v_{i+1}\right) \otimes \Lambda_{P(n)_{*}}\left(\kappa_{i}: x_{i} \in S\right)\right.
$$

and

$$
P(n)_{*}^{M U_{(p)}}\left(P(n)^{\mathrm{op}}\right) \cong \Lambda_{P(n)_{*}}\left(\alpha_{0}, \ldots, \alpha_{n-1}\right) \otimes \Lambda_{P(n)_{*}}\left(\kappa_{i}: x_{i} \in S\right),
$$

where the maps

$$
F_{*}: P(n)_{*}(P(n)) \longrightarrow P(n)_{*}^{M U_{(p)}}(P(n)), \quad F_{*}: P(n)_{*}\left(P(n)^{\mathrm{op}}\right) \longrightarrow P(n)_{*}^{M U_{(p)}}\left(P(n)^{\mathrm{op}}\right)
$$

are the natural projections.
Observe that since $P(n)_{*}^{M U_{(p)}}(P(n))$ and $P(n)_{*}^{M U_{(p)}}\left(P(n)^{\mathrm{op}}\right)$ are not isomorphic as $P(n)_{*}$ algebras, $P(n)$ and $P(n)^{\text {op }}$ cannot be isomorphic as $M U_{(p)}$ ring spectra. However, from [3] they are isomorphic as ring spectrum.

In cohomology, the map

$$
F^{*}: P(n)_{M U_{(p)}^{*}}(P(n)) \cong \Lambda_{P(n)_{*}}\left(Q_{0}, \ldots, Q_{n-1}\right) \otimes \widehat{\Lambda}_{P(n)_{*}}\left(K_{i}: x_{i} \in S\right) \longrightarrow P(n)^{*}(P(n))
$$

is trivial on the second factor and is the inclusion on the subalgebra generated by the Bockstein on the first one.

As further example we consider the case where $R=X^{-1} M U_{(p)}$ with $X \neq \emptyset$. It may very well happen that the $R$-maps $Q_{i}$ become trivial when regarded as maps in the stable category $\mathscr{D}_{S}$ (we have already proven that the $Q_{i}$ are non-trivial in the category $\mathscr{D}_{R}$ ). For instance, let $R=v_{n}^{-1} M U_{(p)}$ and $\widetilde{S}=\left\{v_{0}=p, v_{1}, \ldots, \hat{v}_{n}, \ldots\right\}$. Then $A=K(n)$ is the $n$-th Morava $K$-theory for which

$$
K(n)_{*} \cong \mathbb{F}_{p}\left[v_{n}, v_{n}^{-1}\right] .
$$

According to Wolbert [6],

$$
K(n)_{v_{n}^{-1} M U_{(p)}}^{*}(K(n)) \cong K(n)_{M U_{(p)}}^{*}(K(n))
$$

where the latter is

$$
\widehat{\Lambda}_{K(n)_{*}}\left(Q_{i}: i \neq n\right) \widehat{\otimes} \widehat{\Lambda}_{K(n)_{*}}\left(K_{i}: x_{i} \in S\right) .
$$

We already know that the Bockstein $Q_{i}$ for $i<n$ are non-trivial in $K(n)^{*}(K(n))$, in which they generate an exterior algebra). We now prove that the map $F^{*}: K(n)_{M U_{(p)}}^{*}(K(n)) \longrightarrow$ $K(n)^{*}(K(n))$ sends $Q_{i}$ to 0 when $i>n$.

For any spectrum $X$ there is a natural isomorphism of $K(n)_{*}$-modules

$$
\begin{equation*}
K(n)^{*}(X) \cong \underset{\alpha}{\lim _{\alpha}} K(n)^{*}\left(X^{\alpha}\right), \tag{5.5}
\end{equation*}
$$

where the limit is taken over finite subcomplexes $X^{\alpha} \subset X$. Let $i>n$. From the natural isomorphism of (5.5), it suffices to show that $Q_{i}(x)=0$ for any $x \in K(n)^{*}(X)$ with $X$ finite.

Consider the spectrum

$$
C_{n, i}=v_{n}^{-1} B P \bigwedge_{v_{n}^{-1} M U_{(p)}}^{j \neq n, i} v_{n}^{-1} M U_{(p)} / v_{j}
$$

which satisfies

$$
\pi_{*}\left(C_{n, i}\right) \cong \mathbb{F}_{p}\left[v_{n}, v_{n}^{-1}, v_{i}\right] .
$$

The spectrum $C_{n, i}$ is equipped with a natural morphism of ring spectra $\alpha: P(n) \longrightarrow C_{n, i}$. If $X$ is a finite spectrum, then by Landweber exactness, the map $\alpha$ induces an isomorphism

$$
C_{n, i}^{*}(X) \cong P(n)^{*}(X) \bigotimes_{P(n)^{*}} C_{n, i}^{*} .
$$

It is well known that an element of $v_{i}$ torsion in $P(n)^{*}(X)$ is also of $v_{n}$ torsion. Therefore if $y \in C_{n, i}^{*}(X)$ with $v_{i} y=0$, then $y=0$.

Let $x \in K(n)^{*}(X)$ with $X$ finite, we will show that $Q_{i}(x)=0$. By construction, $Q_{i}=\rho_{i} \circ \beta_{i}$, where

$$
\Sigma^{2\left(p^{i}-1\right)} C_{n, i} \xrightarrow{v_{i}} C_{n, i} \xrightarrow{\rho_{i}} K(n) \xrightarrow{\beta_{i}} C_{n, i} .
$$

The class $Q_{i}(x)$ is the composite

$$
X \xrightarrow{x} K(n) \xrightarrow{\beta_{i}} C_{n, i} \xrightarrow{\rho_{i}} C_{n, i},
$$

but by definition

$$
X \xrightarrow{x} K(n) \xrightarrow{\beta_{i}} C_{n, i} \xrightarrow{v_{i}} C_{n, i}
$$

is trivial, that is $\beta_{i}(x) \in C_{n, i}^{*}(X)$ is a $v_{i}$-torsion element. By the remark above $\beta_{i}(x)=0$ and so $Q_{i}(x)=0$.

## References

[1] Baker, A. \& Lazarev, A.: On the Adams Spectral Sequence for $R$-modules, Algebraic \& Geometric Topology 1 (2001), 173-99.
[2] Elmendorf, A.D., Kriz, I., Mandell, M.A. \& May, J.P.: Rings, Modules and Algebras in Stable Homotopy Theory, Amer. Math. Soc. Mathematical Surveys and Monographs 47 (1996).
[3] Nassau, C.: On the structure of $P(n)_{*}(P(n))$ for $p=2$, Trans. Amer. Math. Soc. 354 (2002), 1749-1757.
[4] Kochman, S.O.: Integral cohomology operations, Can. Math. Soc. Conference Proceedings 2 Part 1 (1982), 437-478.
[5] Strickland, N.P.: Products on $M U$-modules, Trans. Amer. Math. Soc. 351 (1999), 2569-2606.
[6] Wolbert, J.J.: Classifying modules over $K$-theory spectra, J. Pure Appl. Algebra 124 (1998), 289-323.
Department of Mathematics, University of Glasgow, Glasgow G12 8QW, Scotland.
E-mail address: a.baker@maths.gla.ac.uk
URL: http://www.maths.gla.ac.uk/~ajb
Mathematisches Institut, Universität Bern, Bern CH 3012, Switzerland.
E-mail address: alain.jeanneret@math-stat.unibe.ch

